Agenda

City of Visalia Measure N Oversight Committee

Esther Perez – Board of Realtors/Building Industry Myron Sheklian – Downtown Visalians/Property Owners Armondo Apodaca – Hispanic/Visalia Chamber Garrett Lovell – Visalia Economic Development Council Glen Stewart – Citizens Advisory Committee Ed Jones – Citizens Advisory Committee Lisa Alvarado – Council appointee Mark Fulmer – Council appointee Darlene Mata– Council appointee Jason Osborn – Council appointee Matt Seals – Council appointee

Thursday, May 18, 2023 5:30 p.m.

Visalia Administration Office 220 N. Santa Fe St. Visalia. CA

1. Welcome and Public Comment.

This is a time set aside for the Committee to receive public comment on issues which are not already included on the agenda. Public comment regarding items on the agenda may be open to public comment prior to the committee's discussion of the agenda item and before any action is taken on the agenda item. Members ask that comments are kept brief and positive. In fairness to all who wish to speak, each speaker will be allowed three minutes. Please begin your comments by stating your name and providing your city of residence.

- Selection of a chair.
- 3. Review and comment on the recommended Measure N amendment to increase the budget for patrol cars and body-worn camera program. Document attached.
- Review and comment on the recommended Measure N amendment to convert one

 (1) FY 23/24 Measure N Police Officer allocation to two (2) Community Service Officer
 (CSO) allocations. Document attached.
- Future Meetings and Items for Discussion.
- 6. Good of the Order.
- 7. Adjourn.

Next meeting: TBD

In compliance with the American Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in meetings call (559) 713-4512 48-hours in advance of the meeting. For Hearing Impaired – Call (559) 713-4900 (TDD) 48-hours in advance of the scheduled meeting time to request signing services.

Any written materials relating to an item on this agenda submitted to the Measure N Oversight Committee after distribution of the agenda are available for public inspection in the Office of the City Clerk, 220 N. Santa Fe Street, Visalia CA 93292, during normal business hours.



Visalia City Council

Visalia City Council 707 W. Acequia Visalia, CA 93291

Staff Report

File #: 23-0148 Agenda Date: 5/1/2023 Agenda #: 2.

Agenda Item Wording:

Authorize City staff to initiate Measure N amendment process to increase the budget for the Police Department's patrol vehicles and the body-worn camera program.

Deadline for Action: 5/1/2023

Submitting Department: Police Department

Contact Name and Phone Number: Chief Jason Salazar, ext. 4215, jason.salazar@visalia.city <mailto:jason.salazar@visalia.city; Captain Dan Ford, ext. 4151, daniel.ford@visalia.city; Financial Analyst Liz Ybarra, ext. 4250, liz.ybarra@visalia.citydaniel.ford@visalia.city; Financial Analyst Liz Ybarra, ext. 4250, liz.ybarra@visalia.citydaniel.ford@visalia.city

Department Recommendation:

Authorize staff to initiate Measure N amendment process to increase the budget for patrol cars and the body-worn camera (BWC) program due to cost increases. Staff recommends appropriating an additional \$63,300 to address increased vehicle and equipment costs shortfall for patrol vehicles budgeted in this fiscal year and next year. In addition, staff is recommending to renew the five year contract with Axon Enterprise Inc. for a total of \$1,738,749.49 for the Police Department's BWC Program and appropriate an additional \$128,112 for FY 23/24 (Year 1 of the new contract).

Summary:

On October 17th, 2022, City Council approved the purchase of 12 Dodge Chargers for the Police Department. This purchase did not include the Measure N vehicles due to the budget shortfall. The current fiscal year (22/23) budget includes two new patrol vehicles with a total budget of \$114,900. In addition, next year's budget which becomes effective July 1, 2023, includes an additional patrol vehicle which was budgeted for \$61,800. The current cost for a fully equipped patrol vehicle is approximately \$75,000. Staff is requesting up to \$80,000 per vehicle to cover any further price increases.

Measure N also funds the Police Department's BWC Program. The BWC program began in 2018 and consisted of a five-year contract that expires on June 30th, 2023. The total cost for the five-year contract was \$904,233.80. Included in this contract was 130 Officer Safety Plans (including a BWC, Taser, and User License), Signal Sidearm sensors, 23 Pro-User Licenses, 15 Basic-User Licenses, and unlimited digital storage. The contract provided a fixed rate during the period of the contract and was not subject to cost associated with inflation or maintenance.

Over the past four months, staff has worked with Axon to prepare for the next five-year contract. The new 5-year contract has a substantial increase in cost due to several factors including inflation increases since 2018 and a 4% annual increase built into years two through five. Also, this contract includes additional services needed for monitoring and supporting the Department's current use of

Axon equipment and training. As a result of these changes, staff anticipates the allocation from Measure N to increase from \$904,233.80 to \$1,738,749.49 in order sustain the Police Department's BWC program over the next five years.

Background Discussion:

The Measure N 10-year plan outlines the personnel to be funded. This includes equipment for each new position. These positions are added during the two-year budget along with the equipment which includes vehicles. In FY 21/22 a Police Officer position was included in the budget and during that time staff was unable to locate any vendors to purchase a patrol vehicle due to low inventory as a result of pandemic shutdowns and a microchip shortage. This vehicle was rolled into the FY 22/23 budget which includes another new officer/vehicle bringing the total to two vehicles for this current fiscal year. In addition, next years (FY 23/24) budget includes another position and vehicle. Due to vehicle shortages and high inflation, the vehicle cost and equipment to upfit the vehicle (radios, lights, MDT's, etc) has increase significantly. For example, the total cost of a new patrol vehicle in FY 20/21 was \$57,277 (\$36,918 vehicle + \$20,359 vehicle upfit) compared to the City's last purchase in October 2022 of \$75,464 (\$50,459 vehicle + \$25,005 vehicle upfit). This represents an overall cost increase 31.75%.

In order to purchase these vehicles, staff is requesting an additional \$63,300 from Measure N to cover the cost of these three vehicles and allocate funding at \$80,000 for all Measure N vehicles moving forward.

Fund	CIP	Qty	Unit Cost	Budget	Budget Available	FY
141	VH0214	1	\$80,000	\$56,000	(\$24,000.00	21/22
141	VH0253	1	\$80,000	\$58,900	(\$21,100.00	22/23
141	VH0253	1	\$80,000	\$61,800	(\$18,200.00	23/24
		(\$63,300.00				

The Department is also requesting to renew the five-year contract with Axon Enterprise Inc in the amount of \$1,738,750 for the BWC program. The Department began their BWC Program in 2018 and will reach the end of the current contract on June 30, 2023. The new 5 year BWC contract will be more than the current contract which means the annual budget for the BWC will need to be increased as well.

The new contract increase is due to several factors. First, the base price of Axon services has grown significantly (estimated at over \$250,000) since the deployment of the Department's first contract in 2018. Second, the new contract requires an annual increase of four percent in years two through five as opposed to the previous fixed rate. This is an additional \$61,053. Third, Axon now bundles their Officer Safety Plan (OSP) packages. Through the Department's review, staff have selected the most basic and cost-efficient bundle offered by Axon and included additional items for approval.

The OSP7 bundle will include the new Taser 7. The Taser 7 has redesigned darts with Smart Probes which improve accuracy, increase target retention, and improve attainment. There will now be two cartridge types contained in each Taser including Close Quarter Cartridges and Standoff Cartridges which provide different angles of separation to achieve optimal probe spreads at varying distances. The redesigned probes, cartridge types, and targeting device increases the likelihood of an effective Taser deployment in dynamic, critical situations which makes this a more effective less-lethal use of force option, reduces the potential need for other levels of force, and minimizes risk of injury to all involved. The Taser 7 is also equipped with a louder warning arc that serves as an additional audio/visual deterrent for noncompliant behavior and increasing the likelihood of safely de-escalating critical incidents while minimizing risk of injury to all involved. The Taser 7 is able to upload data automatically and will have removable/rechargeable batteries. Axon will also provide the Department taser cartridges throughout the five-year contract and include certification courses for instructors, targeting systems, and training suits that will allow staff to integrate tasers into weaponless defense training programs.

The OSP7 bundle will also provide the Department with new BWCs and include an automatic upgrade or replacement camera, with no additional cost, at the midpoint of the contract. This is an important feature4 in the contract due to the significant wear and tear that BWCs go through. Because they are expected to operate in extreme conditions and inclement weather, having this replacement schedule reduces the likelihood of a BWC failing when it is needed most. This replacement feature for the BWCs was also included in the existing Axon contract. Axon will also provide new docking stations, include Signal Sidearm (a sensor that activates the BWC upon a firearm being unholstered), and provide the GPS location of the BWC when powered on. Finally, the bundle will include Axon Standards which is a use of force reporting system that is integrated with Axon's cloud storage (Evidence.com). This will allow for an improved means of tracking and reviewing use of force incidents in accordance with Department polices and best practices.

The additional services that staff are seeking include Axon Air, Axon Migrate, Axon Investigate, Axon Performance, and Axon VR Training. Axon Air is a software/licensing system that will better manage the Department's Unmanned Aerial Systems (UAS) program by tracking all flight patterns, weather conditions, pilot flight time and camera direction for all drones and drone operators. It will also provide streamlined evidence processing by uploading all UAS footage directly into evidence.com and provide live streaming for incident command. This service is being provided at no cost in the contract.

Axon Migrate will be a one-time service that will transfer the Department's historic digital evidence to evidence.com. The Department's older digital evidence is currently being housed on City servers through the software/hardware Digital Image Management Systems (DIMS). The City is no longer entering new evidence into DIMS due the antiquated storage methods and age of the equipment. The hardware associated with DIMS has reached its end of life and is due for replacement (estimated cost of \$35,000) and cost the Department \$6,000 annually for service. Axon Migrate would use Axon staff to transfer the data to evidence.com and ensure that all retention time requirements are met. This service is being provided at no cost in the contract and will require no ongoing maintenance costs.

Axon Investigate Pro is a forensic digital media software program (which integrates with Evidence.com) that provides several resources for the Investigative staff in relation to video evidence. Video surveillance has become a common and significant factor in criminal investigations, but the processing and review of this evidence is time-consuming and complicated due to the different video formats used by the various surveillance companies. Axon Investigate provides several tools that will help improve the efficiency of these processes all in one program. It has access to the thousands of different video formats (referred to as codecs) that allow staff to examine videos of all types in one program. Axon Investigate also provides the ability to convert these videos into a standard format without diminishing the quality of the evidence. This service will also minimize risk to MIS systems due the potential of viruses being attached to codecs and is included at no cost in the contract.

Axon Performance automates BWC policy reviews and provides actionable, up to date compliance information, such as camera use during calls for service, with an intuitive metrics dashboard and shareable reporting capabilities. This service extracts patterns of behavior from Evidence.com data to improve the Department's review processes, guide policy updates, and identify opportunities for officer training and development. Axon Performance would provide a cost-effective way to assign audits and ensure compliance with audit procedures. It would also make the audit process much easier and less time consuming to manage. The Department currently has over 9.3 Terabytes of digital evidence contained in Evidence.com. This is the equivalent of 46,504 standard definition two-hour movies. Axon Performance will provide the Department an essential tool in conducting thorough and timely audits of this BWC footage.

Axon VR training prepares officers for complex, real-world situations through immersive training that enhances performance, critical thinking and de-escalation skills. Developed in partnership with a cross disciplinary network of first responders, subject matter experts and community leaders, Axon's expansive library integrates with state-of-the-art technology and can be used in multiple settings. As staff continue to improve the Department's internal training (Perishable Skills, built in training days, and incorporation of a training center with the new Public Safety Office Building and Evidence Building), this tool will be a significant addition to our training curriculum. It will allow staff to provide better and more realistic training to deescalate potentially violent situations. Furthermore, the digital "range" that is provided will allow for training related to Taser, and firearms without the cost of munitions.

The common purpose behind all of the proposed options presented above, and in the Department's BWC program as a whole, is risk management. Through the use of BWCs, a level of accountability is provided both for the community and departmental staff. The review of this evidence often clears officers of misconduct while ensuring the preservation of evidence in the rare cases misconduct does occur. BWC evidence can also have substantial effects on mitigating the cost of litigation related to civil actions. Studies indicate that in cases where there is a complete video evidence of the entire contact, federal courts will provide summary judgement (cases are decided based on evidence without going to trial) over 70% of the time. This provides significant relief in litigation costs. Furthermore, being able to have this video evidence is essential towards providing transparency to the community. By implementing tools such as Axon Investigate and Axon Air, we are able to better

demonstrate this transparency.

Risk management surrounding this program must also be applied to the administrative functions of a BWC program. Civil litigation will often target organizations with failing to train or adequately supervise their staff. In cases such as this, it is incumbent on the organizations to show that tools were put in place to ensure adequate training and supervision. As it relates to training, Axon VR is able to provide a mechanism to address training to prevent use of force incidents, where possible, by improving staff's ability to deescalate incidents. Axon Performance addresses concerns on supervision. Because the large amount of digital evidence produced through the Department's BWC program, staff must have the tools needed to conduct random audits, review usage metrics, and ensure that the BWC program is functioning properly. The Department's BWC program has been successful in mitigating civil claims and providing savings for the City in the past and these tools will continue to aide the City moving forward.

Upon researching and selecting the previously described options, staff began negotiations with Axon. The following charts reflect the negotiated costs. Table 1 describes the most basic plan with no additional services added on. Table 2 describes the Department's preferred package, including the additional options previously discussed. Finally, Table 3 includes all of the items or services that the Department will receive for free, with an exception to the \$2,261.97 required for taxes, if a contract with the options listed in Table 2 is approved.

Table 1								
Axon Officer Safety Plan - Basic Bundle								
Package Op	List Price	Net Price	Qty	Term	Subtotal	Тах	Total	
OSP Plan 7*	\$183.07	\$180.07	130	60	\$1,404,468.0	\$62,588.45	\$1,467,056.	
BWC Came Bundle	\$749.00	\$27.79	130		\$3,612.70	\$307.07	\$3,919.77	
10 GB Stora	\$0.55	\$0.55	50	60	\$1,650.00	-	\$1,650.00	
Basic Licens	\$15.00	\$13.00	11700	60	\$11,700.00	-	\$11,700.00	
Pro License	\$23.00	\$39.00	23	60	\$46,644.00	-	\$46,644.00	
Inactive Cha	\$5,000.00	\$2,087.50	1		\$2,087.50	-	\$2,087.50	
Evidence.co Channel Ser		\$5,000.00	1		\$5,000.00	-	\$5,000.00	
Total	•	•	•	•	•	\$62,895.52	\$1,538,057. 72	

^{*}OSP Plan includes Taser 7 (including training supplies), Axon Respond, and Axon Standards and Technology Assurance Plan.

Table 2						
Axon Officer Safety P	lan - Basic	Bundle with	n requested	addition o	n VC and P	erformance
Package OptiList Price	Net Price	Qty	Term	Subtotal	Tax	Total

OSP Plan 7*	\$183.07	\$170.13	130	60	\$1,327,014.00	\$59,796.86	\$1,386,801.86
VR Headset T Bundle	\$41.38	\$41.38	2	60	\$4,965.60	\$369.70	\$5,335.30
VR Tablet TA Bundle	\$23.39	\$23.39	2	60	\$2,806.80	\$210.60	\$3,017.40
VR Controller	\$2,434.69	\$2,789.38	2		\$5,578.76	\$474.20	\$6,052.96
Performance License	\$9.00	\$8.33	130	60	\$64,935.00	-	\$64,935.00
VR User Licer	\$20.00	\$20.00	130	60	\$156,000.00		156,000.00
VR User Licer Additional	\$21.70	\$17.36	25	60	\$26,040.00	-	\$26,040.00
Basic License	\$15.00	\$13.00	15	60	\$11,700.00	-	\$11,700.00
Pro License	\$39.00	\$33.80	23	60	\$46,644.00		\$46,644.00
Standards Implementatio	\$30,000.00	\$29,952.00	1		\$29,952.00		\$29,952.00
Total	•	•	•	•	•	\$60,851.36	\$1,736,487.5 2

^{*}OSP Plan includes Taser 7 (including training supplies), Axon Respond, and Axon Standards and Technology Assurance Plan.

The no cost items listed below in table 3, have a value of \$95,205 and will only cost the City taxes on the equipment of \$2,261.97 if purchased with the items listed in table 2 above.

Table 3									
No Cost Additional Items for Table 2									
Package Opti	List Price	Net Price	Qty	Term	Subtotal	Tax	Total		
VR Headset	\$1,935.00	\$1,935.00	6		\$11,610.00	\$986.00	\$12,596.00		
Extra Left-Har Holster	\$91.25	\$27.79	2		\$182.50	\$15.51	\$198.01		
Extra Right-Ha Holster	\$91.25	\$91.25	2		\$182.50	\$15.51	\$198.01		
Taser Target I	\$85.55	\$85.55	4		\$342.20	\$29.09	\$371.09		
Taser Conduc Target	\$171.05	\$171.05	4		\$684.20	\$58.16	\$742.36		
Axon Camera Bundle	\$749.00	\$27.79	130		\$3,612.70	\$307.70	\$3,919.77		
Axon Investiga License	\$250.00	\$250.00	3	60	\$45,000.00	-	\$45,000.00		
Axon Air Data License	\$32.55	\$32.55	10	60	\$21,330.00	-	\$21,330.00		
Axon Migrate Channel Servi		\$10,000.00	1		\$10,000.00	\$850.00	\$10,850.00		
Total	•	•	•	•	•	\$2,261.97	\$95,205.24		

^{**}A discount was provided in this contract through negotiations to offset this cost.

Fiscal Impact:

Patrol Vehicle

As indicated in the table below, staff request an additional appropriation of \$45,100 in FY 22/23 and \$18,200 in FY 23/24 to address a \$63,300 budget shortfall for the purchase of three patrol vehicles.

Fund	CIP	Qty	Unit Cost	Budget	Budget Available	FY
141	VH0214	1	\$80,000	\$56,000	(\$24,000.00)	21/22
141	VH0253	1	\$80,000	\$58,900	(\$21,100.00)	22/23A
141	VH0253	1	\$80,000	\$61,800	(\$18,200.00)	23/24
Funds Nee	eded		(\$63,300.0 0)			

Body-Worn Camera

As indicated in the Table below, staff requests a total allocation of \$1,738,750 with payment schedule described below:

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Total
Equipment & Services	\$301,599	\$326,687	\$337,608	\$348,965	\$360,777	\$1,675,636
Tax	\$13,513	\$11,693	\$12,152	\$12,630	\$13,126	\$63,114
Total	\$315,112	\$338,380	\$349,760	\$361,595	\$373,904	\$1,738,750

Staff is requesting an additional appropriation of \$128,112 for FY 23/24.

Prior Council Action: June 18, 2018 - Council awarded \$815,618 for BWC program with Axon Enterprise.

Other: N/A

Alternatives: Deny motion directing staff to enter into Measure N amendment process.

Recommended Motion (and Alternative Motions if expected):

Authorize City staff to initiate the Measure N amendment process to increase the budget for patrol vehicles and body-worn cameras.

Environmental Assessment Status: N/A

CEQA Review: N/A

Attachments: Axon Enterprise Quote.



Visalia City Council

Visalia City Council 707 W. Acequia Visalia, CA 93291

Staff Report

File #: 23-0147 Agenda Date: 5/1/2023 Agenda #: 3.

Agenda Item Wording:

Authorize City staff to initiate Measure N amendment process to convert one (1) FY 23/24 Measure N Police Officer allocation to two (2) Community Service Officer (CSO) allocations.

Deadline for Action: 5/1/2022

Submitting Department: Police Department

Contact Name and Phone Number: Chief Jason Salazar, ext. 4215, jason.salazar@visalia.city <mailto:jason.salazar@visalia.city><mailto:daniel.ford@visalia.city><mailto:liz.ybarra@visalia.city>; Financial Analyst Liz Ybarra, ext. 4250, liz.ybarra@visalia.city<a href="mail

Department Recommendation:

Authorize City staff to initiate Measure N amendment process to convert one (1) FY23/24 Measure N Police Officer allocation to two (2) Community Service Officer (CSO) allocations.

Summary:

Community Service Officers (CSOs) have been an important resource for the Police Department for several decades. CSOs are responsible for mitigating the number of non-emergency calls for service that police officers respond to, freeing those police officers to be available for higher priority calls for service and reducing response times. CSOs accomplish this goal by handling non-emergency calls for service such as, traffic collision investigations, abandoned vehicle abatements, parking concerns, and taking reports for minor cold crimes. In addition to minimizing the number of lower priority calls for service handled by police officers, CSO responses also free up police officers to handle higher priority incidents, calls that present a threat to public safety, reduce police officer response times, engage in community outreach events, and conduct proactive enforcement. Staff have concluded that converting one police officer position into two CSO positions will provide a higher level of service to the community by improving response times, allowing for more effective deployment of police officers, and providing a cost savings.

Background Discussion:

In 2016, the citizens of Visalia approved a tax measure (Measure N) that provided additional staffing for the Police Department. This increased staffing allocations for police officer, administrative, and support positions. The City is currently in year seven of the 10-year Measure N spending plan, and will enter year eight at the beginning of the FY2023/24 budget cycle. Through Measure N, the Department is slated to receive one police officer position, which includes a patrol vehicle and all associated equipment for the police officer. The total cost (salary/benefits + vehicle + equipment) to staff this position is estimated at \$267,000.

CSOs are an important support function for patrol officers. CSOs respond to a wide array of calls for

service and significantly reduce the response burden for police officers, reduce response times for the Department, and reduce wait times for citizens of Visalia. CSOs are also trained to handle most traffic accident investigations, conduct traffic control for small and large scenes, and conduct abandoned vehicle abatement. Because CSOs are able to handle non-emergency calls for service and take reports for a large range of cold or minor crime offenses, police officers are able to focus on higher priority calls, with active criminal and public safety threats. Police officers are also able to better address concerns related to public safety and quality of life by being available to conduct proactive enforcement.

Finally, CSOs often gain a lot of experience through their day-to-day activities and observations, and are able to be observed by members of the Department. CSOs often become excellent candidates for police recruit positions and eventual police officer positions. The Department has a significant number of members that began their career with the Department as a CSO and have become very successful within the Department (including Chief Jason Salazar and Captain Luma Fahoum). In a time when law enforcement organizations are struggling to fill police officer positions and competing from the same pool of officer candidates, the addition of CSOs provides the Department with an edge in recruitment, development of quality candidates, and multiple benefits from a public safety and community outreach perspective.

Fiscal Impact:

By converting this police officer position, the Department would be able to fund two (2) CSO positions and still have a cost savings. CSO salaries and benefits are nearly half of a police officer. The total salary and benefits for one police officer is \$171,000 compared to \$91,100 for a CSO. For two CSO positions, the total salary and benefits would be \$182,200. Despite a salary & benefits cost increase of \$11,200 through this conversion, the Department is able to obtain cost savings of \$5,900 for equipment cost, and an estimated \$20,000 in cost savings for a vehicle. This provides a total overall cost savings of \$14,700 as shown in the table below.

Cost Comparison for One Police Officer to Two Community Service Officers									
Position	Sala	ry & Benefits	7	Vehicle	Ec	quipment		Total	
One Police Officer	\$	171,000	\$	80,000	\$	16,000	\$	267,000	
Two CSOs	\$	182,200	\$	60,000	\$	10,100	\$	252,300	
					Co	st Savings	\$	14,700	

	•							

Prior Council Action: N/A

Other: N/A

Alternatives: Deny the motion to direct staff to move forward with the Measure N amendment process.

Recommended Motion (and Alternative Motions if expected):

Authorize City staff to initiate the Measure N amendment process to convert one (1) FY 23/24 Measure N Police Officer allocation to two (2) Community Service Officer (CSO) positions with associated equipment.

Environmental Assessment Status: N/A

CEQA Review: N/A

Attachments: N/A