

## 2019 VISALIA HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Tuesday, April 30, 2019, 1:00 p.m. - 3:00 p.m.  
City Hall East, 315 E. Acequia Avenue, Conference Room 1

### Committee Members:

Dirk Holkeboer, Habitat for Humanity – *Chair*  
Betsy McGovern-Garcia, Self-Help Enterprises – *Vice Chair*  
Brian Todd, Building Industry Assoc. of Tulare/Kings Counties  
Deanna Miller, Christian Church Homes  
Fran Hipskind, Tulare County Association of Realtors  
Ken Kugler, Housing Authority of Tulare County  
Machele Smith, Kings Tulare Homeless Alliance  
Mary Alice Escarsega-Fechner, Community Services & Employment Training  
Marvin Hansen, Planning Commission  
Sarrah Peariso, Planning Commission



*Hyde House, 500 S. Court Street*

### Support Staff:

Brandon Smith, Senior Planner. (559) 713-4636, [brandon.smith@visalia.city](mailto:brandon.smith@visalia.city)  
Paul Bernal, City Planner. (559) 713-4025, [paul.bernal@visalia.city](mailto:paul.bernal@visalia.city)  
Paul Scheibel, Principal Planner. (559) 713-4369, [paul.scheibel@visalia.city](mailto:paul.scheibel@visalia.city)  
Rhonda Haynes, Housing Specialist. (559) 713-4460, [rhonda.haynes@visalia.city](mailto:rhonda.haynes@visalia.city)

## MEETING AGENDA

1. **Welcome and Introductions**
2. **Public Comment**
3. **Adoption of April 1, 2019 Meeting Minutes** (*draft minutes attached*)
4. **Discussion/Follow-Up on Identified Key Issues**
  - Programs for Special Needs Populations – *No additional materials provided*
  - Objective Standards pertaining to SB 35 – *Additional materials provided*
  - Allowed locations for Emergency Shelters – *Additional materials provided. The City is already in compliance with the requirement mandated by Senate Bill 2.*
  - Inclusionary Housing / AB 1505 – *Materials provided at April 1 meeting. The City is not under any obligation by outside agencies to implement inclusionary policies at this time.*
5. **Review Impacts to Sites Inventory / Map** (*additional materials attached*)
6. **Coordinate Public Outreach**
7. **Closing Comments / Next Steps**
8. **Adjourn. Next Meeting Date and Time:** \_\_\_\_\_

## 2019 VISALIA HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Monday, April 1, 2019, 1:00 p.m. - 2:30 p.m.  
City Hall East, 315 E. Acequia Avenue, Conference Room 1

### DRAFT MEETING MINUTES FROM APRIL 1, 2019

Meeting commenced at 1:05 pm in Conference Room 1.

Committee Members Present: Dirk Holkeboer (chair), Betsy McGovern-Garcia (vice chair), Brian Todd, Deanna Miller, Ken Kugler, Machele Smith, Marvin Hansen, Mary Alice Escarsega-Fechner, Sarrah Peariso

Committee Members Absent: Fran Hipskind

Support Staff Present: Brandon Smith, Paul Bernal, Paul Scheibel, Rhonda Haynes

Guests Present: Cindy Wong

#### 1. Welcome and Introductions

Committee Chair Dick opened the meeting. Support staff was introduced, and the Technical Advisory Committee members and guests introduced themselves

#### 2. Public Comment

Cindy Wong stated that her organization (CCLS) would like to see more programs directed at actual affordable housing production.

#### 3. Adoption of March 11, 2019 Meeting Minutes

Minutes were distributed by email prior to and by printed copy at the meeting. No comments were made. Betsy McGovern-Garcia moved and Marvin Hansen seconded to accept the minutes. Unanimously approved.

#### 4. Discussion of Identified Key Issues

Dirk introduced the item. Minutes were distributed by email prior to and by printed copy at the meeting. Betsy provided a brief explanation of the term "by-right" development and Paul Bernal provided a brief explanation of the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) process and its benefits.

- **Senior housing – conditional use to by-right use**

Betsy provided some background, including differentiation of the terms "rental" vs. "assisted living", "apartment complex" and "deed restriction". Brian and Ken supported the by-right use and Machele questioned the need for CUP. It was noted that assisted living units do not count toward RHNA while rentals count if deed restricted. The group consensus was to support preparing a program to categorize senior housing as a by-right use.

- **Mixed Use zones – conditional use to by-right use**

Betsy provided some background, including an example of a potential mixed use project from Self Help Enterprises, wherein ground floor could be live/work or commercial and upper floor could be residential. Sarrah felt it was an oversight not to include residential as a by-right use for sites identified in the RHNA site inventory. There was general consensus to support preparing a program for allowing residential as a by-right use in the Downtown Mixed Use (D-MU) zone but less consensus for allowing residential as a by-right use in the Commercial Mixed Use (C-MU) zone barring concerns of geographical location and segmentation of development wherein a CUP could address such issues. Machele suggested that a program address by-right in C-MU if funding opportunities were available.

- **Programs for Special Needs Populations**

Staff framed the topic, Machele noted there are limitations on time-limited programs that provide funding, and maybe it is a better fit to be addressed in Action Plans. Cindy Wong noted that such programs are aimed in Action Plans but wondered if programs could be worked into the Housing Element. Betsy suggested a program towards securing financing for homelessness and Machele referred to the Homeless Plan as the pertinent strategic plan. Paul Scheibel noted that the state requires programs to have a quantifiable goal and does not look favorably toward generalized statements. The outcome did not result in any program direction in the Housing Element, and more research would be needed on how such programs are addressed in other city documents.

- **Emergency Housing/Shelter**

Staff framed the topic. Discussion ensued on other possible locations for emergency shelters. Mary asked that they be close to services, such as C-SET and Rescue Mission. Sarrah was reluctant to allow by-right use in residential neighborhoods. Machele asked if church-hosted sites would be allowed. Machele noted no "magnet" location, but should be near transportation. Paul Bernal heard from the group that shelters should be located in other zones and close to services, but there was no consensus on other zones. Other methods could be considered outside of strictly allowing uses by zoning district, such as performance standards. Staff will follow up with other jurisdictions' responses to Senate Bill 2, which requires jurisdictions to provide one zone where shelters are permitted by-right.

- **Supportive Housing / AB 2162**

Staff stated that based on state law this is a housekeeping category wherein supporting housing would be made permitted wherever residential uses are permitted. Current/planned examples of supportive housing are located at [1627 S.] Encina and [101] Strawberry. Betsy suggested a benefit for addressing this topic in the Housing Element would be to bring awareness. No specific follow-up recommendation was made and the City will comply with the law.

- **By-Right Multi-Family Housing / SB 35**

Staff framed the topic and explained objective standards. Sarrah asked if the City could re-assess the requirement for wall types and heights, suggesting that a concrete masonry unit wall should be required between single and multi-family zones. Betsy stated that obvious deficiencies should be searched for. Sarrah further suggested there could be different standards for large and small-scale projects. In follow-up staff will prepare a list of existing objective standards in the multi-family residential zone for the committee to review and make suggestions for additions or edits.

- **Inclusionary Housing / AB 1505**

Due to the meeting running late, this topic was not discussed and will be addressed at the next meeting.

5. **Review Impacts to Sites Inventory / Map**

Due to the meeting running late, this topic was not discussed and will be addressed at the next meeting.

6. **Coordinate Public Outreach**

Due to the meeting running late, this topic was not discussed and will be addressed at the next meeting.

7. **Closing Comments / Next Steps**

8. **Adjourn**

Meeting adjourned at 2:55p.m. Next meeting date is April 30, 2019, at 1:00 p.m.

## City of Visalia Multi-Family Residential (R-M-2 and R-M-3) Zones Existing Objective Standards

| <b>Standards</b>                | <b>Code Section</b>     | <b>Requirement</b>   |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| Site Area (Parcel Size)         | 17.16.050               | CUP required for dividing sites <2 acres   |
| Site Area (Density)             | 17.16.060               | Minimum site area per dwelling unit:<br>R-M-2 zone: 3,000 sq. ft.<br>R-M-3 zone: 1,200 sq. ft.   |
| Setbacks                        | 17.16.070 thru 090      | Front yard: 15' for living space, 22' for garages<br>Side yard: 5'<br>Rear yard: 25' for R-M-2 zone, 15' for R-M-3 zone  |
| Height                          | 17.16.100               | R-M-2 zone: 35' or three stories, whichever is taller<br>R-M-3 zone: 35' or 4 stories, whichever is taller<br>* 2nd and 3rd stories adjacent to R-1 zoning shall be designed to limit visibility   |
| Parking                         | 17.16.110, 17.34.020(A) | 1.5 spaces per dwelling unit; may be uncovered or covered. An additional 0.25 spaces per unit may apply under certain conditions. 1.0 spaces per dwelling unit for senior citizen housing developments.  |
| Fences                          | 17.16.120; 17.36.040    | Not to exceed 7' in height except in front yard or street side yard. A 7' open metal fence may be permitted within the front yard or street side yard.<br>A required wall along an arterial or collector roadway shall be designed to include pedestrian access, including within 1/4 mile of transit stops. |
| Trash Enclosures                | 17.16.130               | Must comply with specifications and requirements in Section 17.32.010. May only be located within the front yard setback when deemed necessary due to lack of no other appropriate location.   |
| Site Plan Review                | 17.16.140               | Site Plan Review required for all multi-family developments.   |
| Open Space & Recreational Areas | 17.16.150               | A minimum of 5% site area shall be dedicated to open, common, usable space and/or recreational facilities for use by tenants. Calculated space shall not include enclosed meeting or community rooms.  |
| Parking Area Screening          | 17.16.160               | All parking areas adjacent to public streets and R-1 sites shall be screened from view.  |
| Screening Fence                 | 17.16.170               | Where a multi-family site adjoins a single-family zones site, a screening block wall or wood fence no less than 6' height shall be located along property except in a required front yard or street side yard.   |
| Landscaping                     | 17.16.180               | All developments shall have landscaping, including plants and ground cover, to be consistent with surrounding landscaping in the vicinity.   |

|                        |           |   |
|------------------------|-----------|---|
| Good Neighbor Policies | 17.16.190 | Before issuance of building permits, proponents shall enter into an operational management plan in a form approved by the City for the long term maintenance and management of the development. Includes enforcement of all provisions of the model Good Neighbor Policy as specified by Resolution of the Planning Commission. |
| Signage                | 17.48.090 | Sign Ordinance contains regulations for permanent commercial signs, temporary signs on developed and developing properties, and entrance signs.   |

**Objective Standards Not Contained in Municipal Code**

- Design Review (cannot utilize discretionary judgement)
- Architectural Standards (facades, building materials, colors)
- Building / Parking Orientation
- Lot Coverage / Floor Area Ratio
- Mechanical Unit Screening
- Guest Parking
- Covered Parking

**Jurisdictions Adopting Or** <https://www.ci.benicia.ca.us/housing>

Benicia



## Senate Bill 2: Emergency Shelters Survey Results

| Jurisdiction  | Contact          | Industrial | Light Industrial | Industrial Mixed Use | General Commercial | Community Commercial | Service Commercial | Hillside Commercial | Retail Commercial | General & Service Commercial | Commercial Mixed Use | Manufacturing Commercial | Medical Service | Business Park | Downtown Mixed Use | Downtown Medium Density Residential | Downtown High Density Residential | Downtown Subareas | Specific Plan Areas | High Density Residential R-M-3 | Performance Stds. |
|---------------|------------------|------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------------|----------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-----------------|---------------|--------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|
| Burbank       | Marvin Potter    | P          | P                |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Glendale      | Vista Ezzati     | P          |                  | P                    |                    | C                    | C                  | C                   |                   |                              |                      |                          | P               |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | N                 |
| Dublin        | Amy Million      |            | P                |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| La Mirada     | Gabriel Bautista |            |                  | P                    |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Merced        | Kim Espinosa     |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Hermosa Beach | Nicole Ellis     |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Colma         | Michael Laughlin |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Porterville   | Julie Phillips   |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Santa Barbara | Allison DeBusk   | C          | C                | C                    | C                  | C                    | C                  | C                   | C                 | C                            | P                    | C                        | C               | C             | C                  | C                                   | C                                 | C                 | C                   | C                              | Y                 |
| Chino Hills   | Ryan Gackstetter |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Redwood City  | Lindy Chan       |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | N                 |
| Pasadena      | Marvin Potter    |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Glendora      | Jeff Kugel       |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |
| Santa Ana     | Candida Neal     |            |                  |                      |                    |                      |                    |                     |                   |                              |                      |                          |                 |               |                    |                                     |                                   |                   |                     |                                | Y                 |

**Legend:**

- 'P' = Permitted (By-Right) use in zone
- 'C' - Conditional use in zone
- Blank - Not allowed in zone

**Comments:**

Out of 14 Cities that responded:

- 4 (29%) allow by-right in Industrial-type zones
- 5 (36%) allow by-right in Commercial-type zones
- 2 (14%) allow by-right in Medical Service or Business Park zones
- 5 (36%) allow by-right in Overlay Zones or Specific Plan Areas to target locations of emergency shelters
- 12 (86%) have performance or development standards specifically for emergency shelters

## DRAFT Sites Inventory Adjusted to AB 1379 Limitations

| Sites Inventory<br>Visalia                                     |                               |              |                |                   |               |
|--|-------------------------------|--------------|----------------|-------------------|---------------|
|  | Extremely<br>Low,<br>Very Low | Low          | Moderate       | Above<br>Moderate |               |
| <b>RHNA Need</b>   |                               |              |                |                   |               |
| RHNA Allocation for Visalia                                    | 2,616                         | 1,931        | 1,802          | 3,672             | 10,021        |
| Projects Built & Approved in 2014-2015 (Table 1-36, Page 1-61) | 63                            | 283          | 34             | 862               | 1,242         |
| <b>Total Adjusted Need</b>                                     | <b>2,553</b>                  | <b>1,648</b> | <b>1,768</b>   | <b>2,810</b>      | <b>8,779</b>  |
| <b>Sites Inventory</b>   |                               |              |                |                   |               |
| Vacant Sites (Tables 1-38 & 1-39, Pages 1-68 & 1-69)           | 3,276                         | 3,293        | 735            | 6,347             | 13,651        |
| <b>Underutilized Sites/Redevelopment</b>                       |                               |              |                |                   |               |
| Downtown (Table 1-40, Page 1-75)                               |                               | 309          |                |                   | 309           |
| East Downtown (Table 1-41, Page 1-85)                          |                               | 619          | 14             |                   | 633           |
| Second (Accessory Dwelling) Units                              |                               |              |                |                   | 0             |
| <b>Total Sites Inventory</b>                                   | <b>3,276</b>                  | <b>4,221</b> | <b>749</b>     | <b>6,347</b>      | <b>14,593</b> |
| <b>Difference between RHNA &amp; Inventory</b>                 |                               |              |                |                   |               |
| <b>Total Surplus (Need)</b>                                    | <b>723</b>                    | <b>2,573</b> | <b>(1,019)</b> | <b>3,537</b>      | <b>5,814</b>  |
| <b>AB 1379 Sites Inventory Changes</b>                         |                               |              |                |                   |               |
| Units on Sites >10 ac. or <0.5 ac.                             | -711                          | -446         |                |                   |               |
| Units Identified in Previous Element(s)                        | 169                           | -534         |                |                   |               |
| Non-vacant sites removed from Downtown & East Downtown         |                               | -799         |                |                   |               |
| <b>Adjusted Surplus Accounting for AB 1379</b>                 | <b>181</b>                    | <b>794</b>   |                |                   |               |

Sources: City of Visalia Housing Element Table 1-43 (2016); City of Visalia 2019

This table does not account for units built on vacant sites between 2015 - 2018.

\* For Low Income, 313 units fall under multiple categories but are only counted in the inventory once